

FINAL

**LEBANON CITY COUNCIL
REGULAR SESSION MINUTES
Wednesday, February 21, 2024 7:00 p.m.
Council Chambers**

Remote Via Microsoft Teams: LebanonNH.gov/Live

MEMBERS PRESENT: Assistant Mayor Clifton Below, Erling Heistad, Karen Liot Hill (Arrived 7:45P), Christian Simon, George Sykes (Arrived 7:06P), Douglas Whittlesey and Devin Wilkie

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mayor Tim McNamara, City Manager Shaun Mulholland, and Councilor Karen Zook

STAFF PRESENT: Deputy City Manager David Brooks, Human Resources Director Samantha Lauzon, Finance Director Vicki Lee, Deputy Finance Director Alesia Williams, Planning Administrative Assistant Crystal Taplin, Police Sergeant Adam Leland, LPD Chief Phillip Roberts, LPD Deputy Chief of Police Matthew Isham

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** In the absence of Mayor McNamara, Assistant Mayor Below called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Councilor Simon led the Council in the Pledge.
 - Deputy City Manager David Brooks announced the meeting criteria for the public.
3. **PUBLIC FORUM:** Assistant Mayor Below made the Public Forum announcement.
4. **OPEN TO PUBLIC: No one came forth.**
5. **RECOGNITIONS:**
 - Resolution in Honor of Bruce Garland

WHEREAS, Bruce Garland served as a dedicated member of the Planning Board for the City of Lebanon from August 7, 2015 until November 13, 2023, and as Chair from 2020 until 2023; and

WHEREAS, Bruce contributed his time, expertise, and leadership to the betterment of our community and exhibited exemplary commitment and demonstrated exceptional qualities in navigating the complexities of urban planning and community development; and

WHEREAS, Bruce's unwavering dedication to the responsibilities of the Planning Board has significantly impacted the shaping of the city's future, reflecting his deep sense of civic duty and genuine concern for the well-being of our residents; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Garland's ability to engage with the community, navigate intricate issues, and make informed decisions has set a standard of excellence within the Planning Board that will leave a lasting legacy; and

WHEREAS, Bruce Garland consistently went above and beyond, contributing to the creation and implementation of policies that have positively affected the lives of the residents of Lebanon, New Hampshire. His selfless service, leadership, and commitment have been instrumental in the successful

operation and achievements of the City of Lebanon Planning Board.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Lebanon City Council, on behalf of the City of Lebanon, extends its sincere appreciation for the dedicated service of Bruce Garland for his years of service as a member and Chair of the City of Lebanon Planning Board.

Dated this 21st day of February 2024 at Lebanon, New Hampshire.

Assistant Mayor Below
*On Behalf of Mayor Timothy J. McNamara and
the Lebanon City Council*

- Distinguished Service Award for Police Sergeant Adam Leland
(Please note: Lebanon Police Sergeant Adam Leland's Distinguished Service Award Certificate can be found **on page 6, Council agenda packet**. It was unable to be pasted into the minutes.)

Lebanon Police Chief Phillip Roberts came forth to recognize Sergeant Adam Leland for his acts of bravery and professionalism that he demonstrated during an investigation of a stolen vehicle and the accompanying arrests of the subject on November 17, 2023. During the incident, the subject attempted to pull a knife on Sergeant Leland. Although presented with a deadly force situation, Sergeant Leland was able to quickly point his taser allowing for the apprehension of the armed suspect with no injuries to himself or the suspect. Sergeant Leland is recognized for maintaining a calm composure and a high level of professionalism. His actions ultimately rendered a safe and successful conclusion.

LPD Sergeant Leland was present and accepted this Distinguished Service Award and accolades from the Lebanon City Council and the Lebanon Police Department.

Councilor Sykes joined the meeting at approximately 7:05 PM.

6. ACCEPTANCE OF MINUTES: February 7, 2024 (Regular Meeting)

Councilor Heistad MOVED to approve the February 7, 2024 minutes as written and presented in the February 21, 2024 City Council agenda packet.
Seconded by Councilor Wilkie.

****The Vote on the Motion was approved (6-0).***

7. APPOINTMENTS:

- Planning Board, Brandon Hill (Regular Member)
Deputy City Manager David Brooks MOVED to NOMINATE Brandon Hill as a Regular Member of the Planning Board.

****The Vote on the NOMINATION was approved (6-0).***

- Arts & Culture Commission, Nicholas Gaffney (Reappointment as an Arts Organization Representative)
Councilor Wilkie MOVED to NOMINATE Nicholas Gaffney for Reappointment as an Arts Organization Representative to the Arts & Culture Commission.

****The Vote on the NOMINATION was approved (6-0).***

8. PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS:

- A. Establishment of a Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund** - A public hearing for the purpose of receiving public input and taking action to establish a Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund to include 0 Barrows Street (M/L 77-106 and 77-107), 0 Hanover St Ext (M/L 64-1), 3 Seminary Hill (M/L 86-56), and 5 S. Main St (M/L 86-55); Authorization to Transfer InvestNH grant funds into the Revolving Fund.

Included in agenda packet: *(Detailed information can be found on pages 41-42, Council agenda packet.)*

Available but NOT Included in the agenda packet:

1. January 17, 2024 City Council Agenda Packet.

Deputy City Manager Brooks reviewed the background for the establishment of a Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund.

BACKGROUND

On January 17, 2024, the City Council reviewed and discussed a proposal from the City Manager's Office regarding the redevelopment of city-owned parcels in furtherance of the Council's April 2022 Resolution on Housing. Specifically, the City Manager is proposing to use \$440,000 in grant funding from the InvestNH program, along with the adopted cottage cluster zoning regulations and the Pattern Zoning study's housing plans to execute one or more demonstration projects on city-owned parcels around the community.

On February 7, 2024, the Council adopted a resolution determining that the five parcels referenced above have redevelopment potential and are suitable for redevelopment as part of designated Redevelopment Areas in accordance with City Council Policy CC-102, Real Property Transactions.

In order to provide for the planning and construction phases of the redevelopment proposal, the City Manager recommends that the City Council authorize the establishment of a Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund pursuant to NH RSA 31:95-h for the accrual of grant funds and future sales proceeds and for the payment of costs associated with planning, design, permitting, and construction of residential units on the city-owned properties that have become the focus of the redevelopment proposal, including city-owned properties on Barrows Street, Hanover Street Extension, Seminary Hill and South Main Street.

In addition, it is recommended that the Council authorize the transfer of the \$440,000 in grant funding from the InvestNH program, which was received from the State on February 12th, into the Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund so those funds can be used as seed money for the initial design, permitting, and other costs associated with the redevelopment of the city owned parcels as proposed. It is envisioned that as residential units are constructed and sold, any excess proceeds would be placed in the Revolving Fund as seed money for subsequent redevelopment projects on other city-owned properties

Assistant Mayor Below opened the Public Hearing and the following came forth to speak:

- **Woody Rothe (Ward-3):** He spoke about his reasons why the City should consider the long-term costs for energy efficiency in affordable housing noting it is worth the upfront investment.

- **Georgia Tuttle (Ward-1):** She spoke about her reasons why she felt these buildings should be reserved for City employees and questioned if there was a way to keep the costs of these buildings from rising. Deputy City Manager Brooks noted the plan is to include some declarations of covenants and restrictions that would help to ensure the continuum of affordability. The details of how this will happen has not been worked out yet and the details regarding limits to City employees has also not been discussed. They anticipate this will be some sort of lottery system for City, School District employees and non-profits.

Hearing no further comments from the public, the Public Hearing was closed.

Council Comments:

Councilor Whittlesey clarified that what is being forward tonight is just to put the funds from the grant into a Revolving Fund in an effort to provide greater transparency on how the funds will be spent and further explained his reasons.

Councilor Sykes wanted to be clear and spoke about his reasons for supporting this item, noting the housing crisis in Lebanon.

ACTION:

Councilor Whittlesey MOVED, that the Lebanon City Council hereby authorizes the establishment of a Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund pursuant to NH RSA 31:95-h for the purpose of accumulating grant funds and sales revenue and for the payment of costs associated with the planning, design, permitting, construction, and disposition of residential units on city-owned properties located at 0 Barrows St. (M/L 77-106), 0 Barrows St. (M/L 77-107), 0 Hanover St. Ext. (M/L 64-1), 3 Seminary Hill (M/L 86-56), and 5 S. Main St. (M/L 86-55); that money in the Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund shall accumulate from year to year and shall not be considered part of the City's General Fund; and that the City Manager shall be the agent of the City to carry out the objects of the Fund, as established by the City Council.

BE IT FURTHER MOVED, that the Lebanon City Council hereby authorizes the transfer of \$440,000 in grant funding received from the State of New Hampshire through the InvestNH Program into the Redevelopment Properties Revolving Fund to facilitate the planning, design, permitting, construction, and disposition of residential units on city-owned properties included in the fund Seconded by Councilor Wilkie.

***The Vote on the Motion was approved (6-0).**

9. OLD BUSINESS:

- A.** Discuss possible NHMA Policy Positions for the 2024 NHMA Legislative Policy process

Included in the agenda packet: [*\(All supportive documents/information can be found on Pages 43-44, Council agenda packet\)*](#)

1. 2025-2026 NHMA Explanation of Proposed Policy form

ACTION: No action taken. Item included in agenda as a reminder for the Council to think about policies they might want to request for the upcoming NHMA Forum, which are due on April 15, 2024.

10. NEW BUSINESS:**A. Release of Public School Impact Fees (4th Quarter 2023)**

Included in the agenda packet: *(All supportive documents/information can be found on Pages 45-49, Council agenda packet)*

1. Impact Fee Report as of 12/31/2023
2. November 22, 2021, Memorandum of Understanding between the City of Lebanon and The Lebanon School District, SAU#88

Deputy City Manager Brooks briefly reviewed the background as listed below.

BACKGROUND

A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) was developed in 2010 between the City and the School District for the quarterly transfer of collected Public School Impact Fees to the Lebanon School District for application toward the payment of debt on the (then) new middle school.

On October 12, 2021, the Planning Board authorized a broader use of Public School Impact Fees to include construction, renovation, improvement, or expansion of K-12 school buildings and related building systems, equipment, and furnishings. A revised MOU was developed and signed between the parties on November 22, 2021.

To date \$835,548.13 of collected impact fees has been disbursed to the Lebanon School District.

7/17/2013	\$83,690.78	11/6/2013	\$14,651.99	5/21/2014	\$19,407.00
8/6/2014	\$2,122.75	2/18/2015	\$723.00	5/20/2015	\$2,819.00
7/15/2015	\$1,627.50	11/4/2015	\$936.00	3/2/2016	\$3,156.00
5/18/2016	\$864.00	5/17/2017	\$5,230.00	12/6/2017	\$6,140.75
2/7/2018	\$41,262.70	9/5/2018	\$12,564.45	2/6/2019	\$1,833.10
8/7/2019	\$8,822.20	4/15/2020	\$40,432.02	7/15/2020	\$123,709.65
12/2/2020	\$57,567.42	1/21/2021	\$102,409.40	8/4/2021	\$12,695.86
1/19/2022	\$9,035.45	4/20/2022	\$3,216.15	10/19/2022	\$261,738.35
2/1/2023	\$2,185.00	4/19/2023	\$3,824.44	9/6/2023	\$3,142.57
11/15/2023	\$9,740.60				

This request is for the City Council to authorize the disbursement of \$6,341.26 in collected Public School Impact Fees (through 12/31/2023) to the Lebanon School District.

PUBLIC FACILITIES IMPACT FEES

	PAID BY/LOCATION	MAP/LOT/PLOT	<u>School</u>
10/23/2023	Catherine Patch	73/43	\$ 1,545.70
11/14/2023	Becky Jones	58/91	\$ 2,998.00
11/29/2023	Shawn Griffin	90/13	\$ 804.02
12/12/2023	One Mechanic St	91/264	\$ 993.54
		Balance 12/31/2023	\$ 6,341.26

ACTION:

**Councilor Whittlesey MOVED, that in accordance with Section 213.10 (Administration of Impact Fees) of the Lebanon Zoning Ordinance, and the November 22, 2021 Memorandum of Understanding between the City of Lebanon and the Lebanon School District, SAU 88, the City Council hereby authorizes the disbursement of \$6,341.26 in collected Public School Impact Fees to the Lebanon School District to be applied toward the construction, renovation, improvement or expansion of K-12 school buildings and related building systems, equipment, and furnishings.
Seconded by Councilor Simon.**

****The Vote on the Motion was approved (6-0).***

- B.** Request for Authorization to Transfer Appropriated Funds in the Amount of \$125,000.00 from the General Fund to the Public Assistance Revolving Fund
Included in the agenda packet: *(All detailed supportive documents/information can be found on Pages 50-54, Council agenda packet)*
1. Excerpt from City of Lebanon Proposed 2024 Operating Budget

Deputy City Manager Brooks reviewed the background behind the request as listed above.

BACKGROUND

On December 13, 2023, the City Council approved the City's proposed operating budget for fiscal year 2024. Included within the Interfund Transfers section of the proposed budget was an appropriation of \$125,000 to be transferred from the General Fund to the Public Assistance Revolving Fund. The Public Assistance Revolving Fund was created in 2022 to provide general assistance for housing and emergency shelter, food, fuel, utilities, and other necessities of the public welfare function.

However, when the Budget Adoption Guide was prepared for the City Council's budget hearing, it did not include a specific Resolution for the Council to authorize the transfer of the appropriated funds into the Public Assistance Revolving Fund.

The City Manager recommends that the Council take action now to transfer the appropriated funds into the Public Assistance Revolving Fund as was originally intended in the 2024 budget.

ACTION:

Councilor Wilkie MOVED the following Resolution:

BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED, that the Lebanon City Council authorizes the transfer of appropriated FY2024 funds in the amount of \$125,000.00 from the General Fund to the Public Assistance Revolving Fund for the purpose of providing general assistance for housing and emergency shelter, food, fuel, utilities, and other necessities of the public welfare function.

This Resolution shall be effective upon passage.

Seconded by Councilor Whittlesey.

****The Vote on the Motion was approved (6-0)***

- C.** Report on Council questions from January 3, 2024 discussion of Traffic Patterns on Elm Street West
Included in the agenda packet: *(All supportive documents/information/maps can be found on Pages 55-67, Council agenda packet)*

1. Memorandum from Planning & Development Department staff, dated February 12, 2024
2. Excerpt of minutes from City Council meeting of January 3, 2024

Available, but not included in this Section:

1. January 3, 2024 City Council Agenda Packet

Deputy City Manager Brooks reviewed the background and Planning Staff's memo of findings dated February 12, 2024, which answers the Council's questions as listed in the January 3, 2024 agenda packet.

BACKGROUND

On January 3, 2024, the City Council held a discussion about traffic patterns on Elm Street West in West Lebanon. The discussion was held to consider concerns raised by resident Jennifer Driscoll about an incident that occurred along the street in October 2023 and her request that the City consider taking some action to address what she feels is a potentially hazardous condition related to the roadway.

During the course of the discussion, the City Council requested more information from City staff about certain aspects of the roadways and land uses in the vicinity of Elm Street West and the Twin State Sand & Gravel property before a decision could be made on the issue. The Mayor requested that a report be provided back to the City Council in February 2024.

In response to the Council's request for additional information, Planning & Development Department staff have reviewed historical Class VI roads and USGS maps for evidence of past rights-of-way in the area. Findings show that the road/driveway existed but it does not say anything about the legal status of that road. In addition, staff have reviewed an ALTA/ACSM Land Title Survey prepared for the Twin State Sand & Gravel property in connection with its past development proposals for evidence of easements or rights-of-way benefiting the Twin State property (laid out in 1850). Finally, staff have met with the owner of Twin State Sand & Gravel and inspected the existing uses on the property to verify conformance with the City's zoning regulations. Please see the attached memorandum from Planning & Development Department staff for a summary of their findings regarding the Council's questions.

Again, this agenda item is intended to provide the Council with additional information as requested during the previous discussion about Elm Street West. If the Council wishes to take any particular action, this topic should be scheduled for further discussion at a future meeting.

Council Comments:

In response to Councilor Whittlesey's concern regarding the impact of traffic as mentioned by Ms. Driscoll on page 65, Council agenda packet, Deputy City Manager Brooks spoke about the Minor Site Plan Process and why Elm Street West may not qualify for this process, noting that the impact they would be looking at for traffic, as well as any buildings, falls below the threshold at which the full Site Plan Review process occurs and further explained his reasons. He will follow-up with the Planning Department to see if and when these uses come before the Minor Site Plan Committee or if they elevate to the full Planning Board Committee. Information will be brought back to Council in the future.

Deputy City Manager Brooks also noted that delineator posts have been installed on the bump out island as you approach Seminary Hill along Elm Street West.

ACTION: No action required. Will be put on a future agenda for further discussion by the Council.

- D.** Presentation of First Reading & Set Public Hearing for March 20, 2024: Amendment to

Ordinance #18, Salary Plan, Article II, Non-Affiliated & LPASE Employees, to add a new Chief Building Official & Health Officer as a Grade 13, Non-Affiliated position

Included in the agenda packet: *(All supportive documents/information can be found on Pages 68-69, Council agenda packet)*

Samantha Lauzon, Human Resources Director, was present and reviewed the proposed amendment to Ordinance #18 as listed above.

In response to Councilor Sykes' question regarding how the Health Officer's position would be utilized, Deputy City Manager Brooks noted that the current Code Health Officer position has a limited role in the City. We do not have a full Health Department but we do have a Health Officer for issues (i.e., when a septic system fails; concerns about mold; etc.). This position would take on that role and come away from the position that it occupies now. Whether we go further in terms of formulating a true function for a Health Officer, to take on all aspects of public health, is a discussion the Council will want to have and further explained his reasons.

BACKGROUND

The City Council was asked to take action to amend Ordinance #18, Salary Plan, as follows:

1. Article II, Non-Affiliated & LPASE Employees:
 - I. Add the exempt position of Chief Building Official & Health Officer, as a Grade 13 position within the Planning & Development Department.

Article II, Non-Affiliated & LPASE Employees

City Administration is proposing the addition of a Chief Building Official & Health Officer position within the Planning & Development Department. This Grade 13, exempt position is being created to direct the plan review, permitting, and inspection of all construction activities within the City of Lebanon and to ensure compliance with adopted codes and ordinances. The position will oversee the City's role in restaurant and food inspections, enforce other health codes, as applicable, and provide accountability for the supervision and operation of the Code Enforcement Division of the Planning & Development Department. The position will supervise the Division's staff, providing professional oversight, advice, and direction, and will report to the Planning & Development Director.

Amendment Process

Amending Ordinance #18 requires three separate presentations (see City Charter subsections §419:22, §419:24, §419:25, §419:52), followed by a Public Hearing, and the vote of at least two-thirds (2/3) of all members of the City Council - six (6) members - to adopt.

The Council is asked to recognize the first of three presentations on February 21, 2024, and to schedule a public hearing for March 20, 2024, to amend the Ordinance. The second and third presentations will occur on March 6, 2024, and March 20, 2024, respectively.

The table below reflects all proposed changes (as shown in **red** text), to include the addition of new positions, changes in position titles and/or classification.

These changes would be effective upon passage.

1. Acknowledge First Presentation:

Councilor Wilkie MOVED, that the Lebanon City Council acknowledges the first of three presentations to amend Ordinance #18, Salary Plan, Article II, by adding the position of Chief Building Official & Health Officer (Grade 13, Non-Affiliated) in the Non-Affiliated & LPASE Employee compensation and classification schedules as outlined in the February 21, 2024, City Council Agenda Packet.

Below is an excerpt of the Non-Affiliated & LPASE Employees' compensation and classification schedules impacted by the proposed change described above. Changes to the compensation and classification schedules are shown in **red** type; new positions and retitled or reclassified positions are shown in **red bold** type; position deletions are shown stricken and in **red italics** type.

REGULAR FULL-TIME / REGULAR PART-TIME NON-AFFILIATED & LPASE EMPLOYEES 2024 SALARY & GRADES					
Grade	Position Title	Hourly		Weekly	
		Minimum	Maximum	Minimum	Maximum
13	Chief Building Official & Health Officer	-	-	\$1,734.53	\$2,341.63
	Chief Innovation Officer				
	Cyber Security Analyst	-	-	-	-
	Deputy Finance Director	-	-	-	-
	Deputy Human Resources Director	-	-	-	-
	Deputy Fire Chief**	-	-	-	-
	Information Systems Manager**	-	-	-	-
	Maintenance Manager	-	-	-	-
	Police Captain**	-	-	-	-
	Deputy Planning and Development Director	-	-	-	-
	Systems and Operations Administrator	-	-	-	-

**Denotes LPASE Employees

1. Schedule Public Hearing:

Councilor Wilkie FURTHER MOVED, that the Lebanon City Council hereby schedules a public hearing for Wednesday, March 20, 2024, beginning at 7:00 PM, in Council Chambers, City Hall, and Remote via City's Virtual Platform, for the purpose of receiving public input and taking action to amend Ordinance No. 18, Salary Plan, Article II, Non-Affiliated & LPASE Employees, to add the position of Chief Building Official & Health Officer (Grade 13), as fully described and contained in the February 21, 2024, City Council Agenda Packet.

Seconded by Councilor Whittlesey.

***The Vote on the Motion was approved (6-0-1). Councilor Liot Hill abstained from vote.**

Councilor Liot Hill arrived at approximately 7:45 PM, which was in the middle of the motion

E. Citizen Request for Ceasefire Resolution

Included in the agenda packet: *(The Ceasefire Resolution in its entirety can be found on pages 70-75, in the February 21, 2024 Council agenda packet)*

1. Proposed Ceasefire Resolution

BACKGROUND

On February 6, 2024, the City Manager’s Office received a request from a resident of the City to have the City Council consider adopting the attached proposed Ceasefire Resolution as listed below and present in the council agenda packet.

“PROPOSED” CITY OF LEBANON CEASEFIRE RESOLUTION

WHEREAS the Mayor of Lebanon and the City Council of Lebanon (henceforth referred to as “the Council”) affirm the human rights of all people regardless of race, skin color, national or ethnic origin, religious or political opinion or activity, and cultural group, in accordance with the Welcoming Lebanon Ordinance;¹ and

WHEREAS violence anywhere, especially collective punishment against a particular group of people, gives rise to a dangerous logic of dehumanization that risks compromising the safety and dignity of residents of the City of Lebanon, and therefore must be opposed, both here in Lebanon and everywhere; and

WHEREAS Palestinian people and those who speak in favor of Palestinian human rights have been targeted by racist, anti-Palestinian, and Islamophobic hate in this country, including three Palestinian students who were shot while speaking Arabic and wearing keffiyehs, a Palestinian cultural symbol, only an hour and a half away in Burlington, VT;² and

WHEREAS many Americans are speaking up for Palestinian human rights, protesting in cities and towns across the country, including in various parts of New Hampshire, and the majority of Americans are calling for a ceasefire;³ and

WHEREAS the Council grieves the tragic loss of human life, both Palestinian and Israeli; and

WHEREAS Israel has launched an unprecedented violent campaign against the Palestinian people, resulting in a genocide⁴ of over 27,300 Palestinians in Gaza, including over 11,500 children, and more than 8,000 missing under the rubble at time of writing;⁵ and

WHEREAS more than 1.9 million Palestinians in Gaza have been displaced, with many of their homes destroyed and no safe haven to turn to, and many are living without access to food, water, shelter, or other basic needs for themselves and their families, with the threat of death from starvation becoming a cruel reality;⁶ and

WHEREAS the current proliferation of violence, including the October 7 Hamas attack and Israel’s siege on the Gaza Strip, comes in the context of 75 years of displacement of the Palestinian people,⁷ 56 years of unlawful Israeli settlements in the West Bank (deemed as such by the United Nations Security Council in 2016),⁸ and 17 years of an Israeli-imposed blockade of Gaza;⁹ and

WHEREAS the U.S. government continues to unconditionally fund Israel, supplying funds amounting to nearly \$300 billion (inflation adjusted) , including over \$200billion dollars in military funding, since 1948;¹⁰

and

WHEREAS \$219,005 in annual military funding comes from federal taxes paid by residents of Lebanon;¹¹ and

WHEREAS cities across the country are speaking up for what is right, calling for a full and lasting ceasefire, including Atlanta, Seattle, Minneapolis, Detroit, Oakland, San Francisco, Seattle, Portland, OR, Portland, ME, and Albany, exercising democratic process; and

WHEREAS the majority of countries, 153 nations, around the world have voted in favor of a ceasefire as part of a United Nations General Assembly resolution;

WHEREAS there is ample precedent for the Council to weigh in on global matters that also impact residents of Lebanon, for example the 2017 Resolution in Support of the Paris Climate Agreement;¹² and in light of the ways Israel's bombardment of Gaza gravely exacerbates the climate crisis,¹³ which endangers residents of Lebanon;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Mayor of Lebanon and the Lebanon City Council call for an immediate and permanent ceasefire; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council calls for the release of all hostages, both Palestinian and Israeli; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council urges the New Hampshire state government to pass a resolution of its own to call for a ceasefire in Israel and Palestine, and to urge President Biden and Congress to follow suit; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council calls directly on our congressional delegation, namely Congresswoman Ann Kuster, Senator Jeanne Shaheen, and Senator Maggie Hassan, to pressure Israel to adhere to an immediate and permanent ceasefire; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council calls on the U.S. federal government to both pressure Israel to lift its onerous restrictions on the border crossing at Rafah to allow the full capacity of humanitarian aid required to fully meet the food, water, shelter, and medical needs of the people of Gaza, and to resume funding to aid organizations including UNRWA; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council calls on the U.S. federal government to cease all funding and arming of Israel as a consequence of its government's well- documented crimes against humanity, both historically¹⁴ and in the recent case against Israel presented by South Africa in the International Court of Justice,¹⁵ and to reinvest this money in helping Palestinians rebuild their homes and critical infrastructure, such as schools, hospitals, roads, and water treatment, storage, and distribution infrastructure; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council urges the U.S. federal government to reinvest funds that would otherwise have been appropriated as aid to Israel to address the needs of the American people, including the people of the City of Lebanon, through programs such as affordable housing and healthcare; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council reinforces its commitment to the values of the City of Lebanon as stated in the Welcoming Lebanon Ordinance, and encourages Lebanon residents to feel safe

in practicing and expressing their cultural and religious identity freely without fear of discrimination; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council denounces the rise in anti-Palestinian racism, Islamophobia, and antisemitism within the United States as a result of Israel’s genocide of Palestinians in Gaza; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that a copy of this resolution will be printed and sent to the offices of all state and federal congressional representatives beholden to the residents of the city of Lebanon.

Assistant Mayor Below opened discussions/comments to the Public and the following came forth to speak: *(Please Note: Due to the number and length of each individual’s testimony, their comments and written text are only summarized below. Complete testimonies can be viewed in their entirety (either by video or by transcription) on the City’s website for this meeting. Lebanonnh.gov; scroll down the agendas & minutes and search for the February 21, 2024 City Council Meeting.)*

- **Rachel Kent (Ward-3):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution and handed out a copy of a Petition that contained the names and comments of 247 individuals (77 of whom are Lebanon residents) who supported the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Evelyn Campbell (Ward-3):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Rachel Kent (Ward-3):** She again came forward and spoke about her reasons for passing the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Sabiya Ahamed (Ward-2):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Ahoam Abuawad (Ward-2):** She spoke about her reasons for supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Jordan Narrol (Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons for supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Ramsey Al Sheikh (Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Abdul Latif (Ward-2):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Richard Abel (Ward-1, Former State House Representative for Lebanon):** He spoke about his reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution because the language, as written, is a problem and further explained his reasoning. He also felt the City of Lebanon should not be involved in international foreign policies and did not see how the City of Lebanon would influence the rest of the world or our Federal Government.
- **Dr. Graham Edwards (Ward-2):** He spoke about his reasons for supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Maria Solice Kennedy (Ward-2):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Ben Spiro (Ward-1):** He spoke about his reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.

- **Elon Kluger (Hanover, student at Dartmouth College):** He spoke about his reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Oren Poleshuck-Kaidel (Dartmouth Student, Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Jeremy Katz (Ward-3):** He spoke neither for/against the Ceasefire Resolution but about his concerns regarding how both the Lebanon, NH Muslim/Jewish residents feel unsafe, which should be of concern to the City Council, noting we may not be doing a good job at making people in our own community feel like they are part of our community and further explained his reasons.
- **Bradley Conway (Manchester NH):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Max Orman—Kollmar (Graduate Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Ahmad Herzallah (Dartmouth student, Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his personal reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Daisy Goodman (Lyme, NH):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Dr. Golamar Nikpour (Ward-3):** Statement read on his behalf (by Nancy Welch, Hanover, NH) in support of the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Nancy Welch (Hanover, NH):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Ainan Adeam (Dartmouth Student, Hanover, NH):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Roan Wade (Hanover, NH):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Kristina Woalff ((location not given):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Phillip Mulligan (Ward-3):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Paul Yange (Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Dina Stein (Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** She spoke about her reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.

Assistant Mayor Below reminded the audience that this is not the time for back-and-forth conversations between speakers.

- **Yaila Volle (Ward-2):** Statement read on her behalf (by Hayden Smith, Hanover, NH)

supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.

- **Hayden Smith (Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Danny Keane (Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Harper Richardson (Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Jeanna Spiro (Ward-1):** She spoke about her reasons for not supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Sam Amkieh (Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** He spoke about his reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Miriam Garcia (Student, Dartmouth, Hanover, NH):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Sarah Wraight (Ward-1):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Aleks Austin (Ward-2):** She spoke about her reasons for supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Yousef Helali (Vermont resident):** He spoke about his reasons for supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.
- **Lucie Rathgeb (Norwich, VT):** She spoke about her reasons supporting the Ceasefire Resolution.

Hearing no further comments from the public, either in person or remotely, Assistant Mayor Below closed the public discussion session.

Council Discussions/Deliberations Summary:

Councilor Heistad spoke about the horrors of WWII, the Vietnam War, and other wars, noting it is not a pretty scene no matter who is dying or shooting. We need to think about this and take it seriously. This happens again and again in our world and felt we need to stand up and say enough is enough.

Councilor Wilkie: He supported the Ceasefire Resolution and thought the Council should take action tonight. Many communities are taking action or speaking out against genocide and are in favor of a ceasefire. They are not acting out of turn, they are acting out Democracy. In this Resolution, he thought a number of points became apparent.

1. The resolution calls for an immediate ceasefire.
2. The resolution calls for the release of all hostages, both Palestinian and Israeli. One of the most frequent arguments against this is that it needs to call for the release of all hostages, this does that.
3. The resolution also talks about our State government and our Congressional delegation and addresses something the Lebanon City Council has addressed in the past.

He felt that this is something that affects Lebanon residents and is something we have heard about from many Lebanon residents. Ultimately, regardless of what other communities are feeling or experiencing, this is not necessarily a combative resolution. In fact, it is the opposite. It is asking for peace rather than combat. He supported this Ceasefire Resolution and further explained his reasons.

Councilor Liot Hill: She thanked everyone who came and testified, noting this is a beautiful exercise in Democracy. For the record, having the Lebanon City Council weighing in on foreign policy is absolutely unprecedented. The City Council did affirm the Paris Climate Accord but it was specifically related to energy, which is a topic that we have within our jurisdiction. The only extent to which we have been engaged in any kind of international discussions has been about particular policy issues that are in front of the City Council. She understood Councilor Wilkie's and others points about their desire for urgency but also understands that sometimes you have to take a little more time to get something right.

In its current form, she could not support this Ceasefire Resolution, even though she has empathy for these requests. Furthermore, we have a process. For example, matters relating to energy goes to our Energy Advisory Commission (LEAC) who debate and gather more information about the issues, then sends their recommendations back to the City Council. This has also been our practice with the Economic Development Commission. This seems like a matter that would be appropriate to send to our DEI (Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion) Commission and have them work with the people who have proposed this resolution, noting she would be in favor of a resolution that really focuses on what can be done in Lebanon to make people feel safe. This is also something we have to address and requested the Council to take more time so we can get this right and pass a resolution with unanimous support instead of forcing a vote tonight on something that people may have misgivings about.

Councilor Whittlesey: He echoed what Councilor Liot Hill said and noted he did not support this resolution in its current form, although he condemns the violence, death, and the humanitarian crisis. International Foreign Policy to him is not the purview of the City. Where we have engaged our various delegations was really related to policy at both a State and Federal level that directly impacted municipalities. He would like to see a statement of our values/principles that echoes and re-enforces what is in the Welcoming Lebanon Ordinance, noting Lebanon is a City that welcomes all. He agreed this resolution should go to the DEI Commission, noting his biggest concern is that our residents feel safe. Our residents deserve to feel safe and welcomed here. They should not be targeted, subjected to violence, or subjected to hate speech. Something should be added to the Welcoming Lebanon Ordinance stating that Lebanon is against islamophobia and against antisemitism. He did not feel forcing a vote (tonight) serves anyone any good.

Councilor Sykes: When this resolution proposal first came before the Council (December 2023) he spoke in favor of seeing such a resolution. He echoed again why he felt that it is important for the Council to take a stand about a resolution. After speaking about his 17 years of volunteer work with the American Red Cross/International Federation of the Red Cross (Red Crescent), he felt that sometimes taking baby steps is the way to get to where we need to be. In his mind, that first step would be a ceasefire and expressed his support for a ceasefire. We heard a lot of discussion from many citizens and other Councilors that it is not the place for the Lebanon City Council to get involved with foreign policy, but disagreed, noting our City Councilors have been elected to be the voice of our citizens and it is incumbent upon us to take sometimes difficult, unrewarding positions because we are the voice of our citizens. He felt having some other commission take a look at this could not be done in a timely manner.

The two most important pieces of the resolution are: 1. There should be a ceasefire and 2. The hostages should be released.

Councilor Simon: He spoke about his 30 years of experience in the Fire and Emergency Medical Services noting he has seen violence locally at its worst and it affects us all and questioned if there was a way where we can meet in the middle of the road to serve the greater good: Peace. He was concerned about the resounding feeling of residents/citizens not feeling/being safe in Lebanon.

One thing he learned when he got on the Council is that there are processes and there are a lot of Boards/Committees/Commissions and felt there is a process that we need to follow. A good starting point for this process would be to start with the DEI Commission. He also noted that while there may have been a little rumble now and then, all-in-all everyone has been very respectful of one another and has listened to one another. Why can't we take that forward as a community and build upon it so all of our citizens can feel safe and respected? He concurred with Councilors Whittlesey and Liot Hill that the next place for this to go would be our DEI Commission for their review and bring their recommendations back to the Council. He also spoke about the need to have a full Council present, noting the Mayor and one of the Council members were absent, noting that if this (resolution) moves forward, he will abstain because he will not pick one side or the other.

Assistant Mayor Below: He appreciated everyone coming out and sharing their passionate feelings. What happened on October 7th (2023) and what has happened since makes him sick, including the funding from the US Government, noting he does not have a problem with calling for a ceasefire – it is overdue. He does see where some people would think that a few of the statements are not as balanced as they might be and would like to see the resolution tweaked so that it is more balanced.

One thing that is missing from the resolution is:

- We abhor the murder, rape, pillaging and kidnapping that occurred on October 7th and we abhor the murder/killing of thousands of innocent children, women and men and it cannot go on with our weapons.

He spoke about certain items in the resolution that he agreed with and items he felt needed changes, noting the Palestinian people are entitled to a State as well. While he was not comfortable with all of the text in the resolution, the bottom line is that he does not have a problem with the Council expressing their support for an immediate ceasefire.

Councilor Wilkie: He wanted to propose a possible solution that may help everybody to feel more comfortable and felt it would be appropriate for the Council to make a motion that includes:

1. Affirm its support for an immediate permanent ceasefire, and
2. Release of all hostages on both sides (Palestinians and Israeli), then
3. Share this proposed resolution with the DEI Commission

As a member of the DEI Commission, he requested specific changes that everyone would like to see in the resolution.

Councilor Liot Hill MOVED to extend the meeting to 10:15.

Seconded by Councilor Whittlesey.

****The vote to extend the meeting was approved (7-0)***

Councilor Whittlesey: He supported Councilor Wilkie’s suggested solution. His concern with the proposed Ceasefire Resolution, as written, is that there needs to be balance. The way it is written, is that it is putting the ownership for everything in Israel, noting Israel should not be absolve in its part in this or what it has done (since October 7, 2024), but the attacks were initiated by Hamas and continued to explain his reasons regarding historical events. He would support adding (to the resolution) a call for ensuring the provision of humanitarian aid directly to the people who need it. He did not want to move quickly on this for the sake of moving quickly because it pays to be very careful and clear with what we are trying to say.

Councilor Liot Hill: She would appreciate it if the City Council could deliberate more about the issue of whether the Lebanon City Council should be weighing in on foreign policy. This is a precedent we are setting for the future and the City Council here-to-for has not weighed in on foreign policy or military engagements. She did not feel the Lebanon City Council has actually grappled with the question of whether we should be starting to advise our federal delegation or the President of the United States on matters of foreign policy. Maybe this is something we should be doing but has not been able to talk to the members of the Council on this issue. Secondly, we can ask the DEI Commission to hold an emergency meeting if we feel that we want to move quickly. They know this issue was likely to come before them and she absolutely could support a resolution that calls for peace and condemns violence.

If we are going to do something, let’s do it intentionally, deliberately, and respectfully and requested the Council have the DEI Commission take up the matter of the Ceasefire Resolution and come back to the Council with a resolution calling for peace and condemning violence within 30 days.

Councilor Heistad: He was looking at the dangers if the Council does not make a decision, noting that in looking back, there are examples where if we, as a people, we rose up and said, “No carpet bombing,” millions of people would not have died and further explained his reasoning about what happened during previous wars/conflicts and what is happening now.

Councilor Wilkie *MOVED to extend the meeting to 10:30.*

Seconded by Councilor Liot Hill.

**The vote to extend the meeting was approved (7-0)*

Councilor Wilkie *Moved that it be resolved that the Lebanon City Council call for an immediate and permanent ceasefire; and*

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED *that the Council calls for the release of all hostages, both Palestinian and Israeli; and*

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED *that the Council Call for humanitarian aid to the people who need it.*

MOVED ALSO, *that the Lebanon City Council directs the DEI Commission, along with specific feedback regarding proposed changes, to examine the ceasefire resolution as presented in the February 21, 2024 packet, with a response to be provided to the Lebanon City Council no later than the end of March 2024.*

Seconded by Council Sykes.

Assistant Mayor Below requested an amended motion adding in (after the first sentence after ceasefire) in the word “Israel and Palestine.”

Councilor Wilkie *Moved to amend the Motion to read as follows:*

Councilor Wilkie Moved that it be resolved that the Lebanon City Council call for an immediate and permanent ceasefire in Israel and Palestine; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council calls for the release of all hostages, both Palestinian and Israeli; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Council Call for humanitarian aid to the people who need it.

MOVED ALSO, that the Lebanon City Council directs the DEI Commission, along with specific feedback regarding proposed changes, to examine the ceasefire resolution as presented in the February 21, 2024 packet, with a response to be provided to the Lebanon City Council no later than the end of March 2024.

Seconded by Councilor Sykes.

Councilor Wilkie spoke to his motion saying it is relevant and important to have the Council discuss whether they should address issues outside its jurisdiction but believed now is not the time to address this issue. We do not stop in the middle of gunfire to ask whether our actions are just or ask what we want to do next. The time to call for a ceasefire is now. The time to determine whether we should be transferring that call into a request for the Federal /State Government may be coming in a month and that is why we are going to pass the larger resolution to DEI for their specific feedback and did think the call for a ceasefire was unprecedented because what is happening is also unprecedented. This particular conflict has extensive funding using taxpayer dollars. It's not the case that because of this one instance we will then be called upon to address every geopolitical conflict. While many of the other topics in the resolution may be controversial to some, calling for a ceasefire, the release of hostages, and humanitarian aid to those in need all seem consistent with what the City Council has advocated/supported to date. He hoped his Motion would pass and the Council would have a broader discussion in the months ahead.

Councilor Liot Hill: She realized this was not popular in this room right now, but the truth is that the people of Lebanon did not vote for us to weigh in on foreign policy matters. That is not something the City Council has ever done before and when people elected us to represent them, they did not do it with any understanding that we were going to suddenly weigh in on foreign policy matters. If what we were being asked to do was to send this resolution to the voters, she would absolutely support that. The people of Lebanon should weigh in on what they think. Without taking more time to talk about what is appropriate is not going to all of a sudden stop the violence that is happening. Yes, what we do at the local level matters, but it is not going to stop the violence. We can take a couple more weeks to deliberate on this, which is what we do. Democracy is about deliberation. We have had more deliberation over masking during COVID; over whether we should open up a homeless shelter; what we should do with the redevelopment of Main Street in West Lebanon; and more mundane issues. To be clear, she did not support the Council rushing to do something we have never done before, or the people of our City have never seen us do before and have never weighed in on.

The Council continued their deliberations regarding: The Council's process in making decisions; consulting the City's residents in a transparent way; how weighing in on foreign policy issues is a big shift for the Council and should not be done piecemeal or be forced on them; having this Ceasefire Resolution go to DEI for their review and recommendation; the need to have the full City Council present for a discussion regarding foreign policy and if this is something we should do; how setting a precedent should be mindful; how the Council in Lebanon is here for the purpose of overseeing the City government and making sure it is running effectively; how the City could easily be overwhelmed by being asked to weigh in on foreign policy matters (i.e., various conflicts wars, insurrections, coups, etc.); and, how not taking action on this resolution tonight is not because we are failing in raising our voices.

Councilor Wilkie: He is concerned that if the Ceasefire Resolution is sent to the DEI Commission without a clear intention, the City Council may not act on their recommendation. Councilor Wilkie discussed the reasons behind this concern. Overall, he wants to affirm whether the Council will address this topic, acknowledging that the details will be discussed later. Councilor Wilkie made clear that he will not be withdrawing this motion.

The Council continued with their lengthy debates and explained their reasonings on whether or not they should weigh in on foreign policies.

Councilor Liot MOVED to extend the meeting to 10:45P.

Seconded by Councilor Whittlesey.

***The Vote on the MOTION was approved (6-0). Councilor Heistad was not in the room at the time this vote was taken.**

The City Council discussed the motion further. During their discussion, there was a significant focus on whether they should be involved in foreign policies.

Assistant Mayor Below informed the Council that what they are being asked to vote on is not the original Ceasefire Resolution presented in the agenda packet, but just Councilor Wilkie's Amended Motion.

(Note: Procedurally, when someone wants to "Call the Question," it is a motion to end a debate and vote on a pending proposal bringing it to an immediate vote without further debate.)

Councilor Sykes MOVED to call the question. (Voting on the Amended Motion from Councilor Wilkie without any further debate.)

***Vote on the question failed (3-3). Assistant Mayor Below abstained.**

Councilor Liot Hill MOVED to extend the meeting to 11:00PM

Seconded by Councilor Wilkie.

Assistant Mayor Below informed the audience that the meeting would end if there were any more disruptions.

***The Vote on the Motion to extend the meeting to 11:00 PM was approved (7-0).**

After more Council deliberations took place regarding whether or not the Council weigh in on foreign policy issues and Councilor Wilkie's Amended Motion, the following action was taken

ACTION:

**After hearing no further comments from the public, Assistant Mayor Below Called the Question
Seconded by Councilor Sykes.**

Voting Ya: Assistant Mayor Below and Councilor's Wilkie, Heistad and Sykes.

Abstaining: Councilor's: Liot Hill, Simon, and Whittlesey.

***The Vote on the MOTION was approved (4-0-3).**

The Motion as listed below was carried.

Councilor Wilkie Moved, that it be resolved that the Lebanon City Council call for an immediate and permanent ceasefire in Israel and Palestine; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED *that the Council calls for the release of all hostages, both Palestinian and Israeli; and*

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED *that the Council calls for humanitarian aid to the people who need it.*

MOVED ALSO, *that the Lebanon City Council directs the DEI Commission, along with specific feedback regarding proposed changes, to examine the Ceasefire Resolution as presented in the February 21, 2024 packet, with a response to be provided to the Lebanon City Council no later than the end of March 2024.*

Seconded by Councilor Sykes.

Councilor Sykes left the meeting at approximately 10:45PM.

11. CITY MANAGER REPORT:

Deputy City Manager Brooks updated the Council on the following:

- Candidate's Forum: Hosted by Upper Valley Business Alliance
- Community Conversation on the Strategic Plan.
- 20 Spencer Street Proposals

12. COUNCIL REPRESENTATIVES TO OTHER BODIES: NONE

13. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:

- Further Discussion regarding Report on Council questions from January 3, 2024 discussion of Traffic Patterns on Elm Street West

14. NON-PUBLIC SESSION: NONE

15. ADJOURNMENT:

Councilor Wilkie MOVED for adjournment.

Seconded by Councilor Whittlesey.

**The Vote on the MOTION was unanimously approved (6-0). Councilor Sykes was not present for this vote.*

The meeting was adjourned at 10:53 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Dona E. Gibson
Recording Secretary